

Board of Management Level of Education and Administrative Experience: Predictors of School Budgetary Processes in Public Secondary Schools in Kangundo Sub-County, Kenya

Muinde J.M, Kingi M Petronilla

University of Nairobi, Department of Educational Management, Policy and Curriculum Studies
Faculty of Education

DOI: <https://dx.doi.org/10.47772/IJRISS.2025.908000260>

Received: 24 July 2025; Accepted: 30 July 2025; Published: 05 September 2025

ABSTRACT

Budgetary processes are universal and essential tools for effective financial planning and management. Budgetary processes help in the establishment of predestined goals, giving progressive performance reports and evaluation of actual performance in terms of predetermined outputs. The objective of the study was to establish the influence of the Board of Management education level and administrative experience on school budgetary processes. The study applied the Systems theory propounded by Ludwig Von Bertalanffy in 1940s and 1950s. The study adopted mixed methods approach inclusive of both quantitative and qualitative methods designs and targeted Principals, Teachers, B.O.M members and (1) County Auditor. The sample size consisted of 12 Principals, 32 teachers, 83 B.O.M members and (1) County Auditor who were sampled using both purposive to sample the principals and the county auditor and stratified random sampling technique applied for sampling both the schools and B.O.Ms members. The process of collecting data was run through interviews and questionnaires. Instruments' validity was ascertained by seeking expert guidance from the university supervisors. The instruments' reliability was ascertained by conducting a pilot study. Ethical consideration was apprehended where the researcher presented a research permit and informed consent to participants and confirmed that the study participation was voluntary and the obtained data would only be used for the purposes of the study. Statistical package for social sciences was applied in the data analysis process where both descriptive and inferential statistics were analysed to determine the existing relationship by the use of frequencies, mean and standard deviation. Pearson product moment correlation coefficient and inferential statistics were used to demonstrate the level of significance among the study variables. The findings of the study were that education level influences budgetary processes to a great extent with a correlation of $r(76) = 0.665$, $p(0.000) < 0.05$. On administrative experience the study found that it influences the participation rate in the school budgetary processes moderately with a significant correlation of $r(76) = 0.479$, $p(0.000) < 0.05$. The research concluded that both education level and administrative experience influences budgetary processes. The survey suggest that further studies should be done on the influence of professional training of B.O.Ms on Budget controls and Principals technical skills on Budgetary process in public secondary schools.

Key words: Principals; Board of management members: budgetary processes: level of education: Administrative experience: teachers; schools; budget.

INTRODUCTION

Budgeting processes refer to the systemic planning, implementation, controlling and evaluation of a budget to ensure proper service delivery based on financial assets, including fixed resources, time, and money set to achieve desired economic outputs. Effective Budgeting, budgetary processes, and procedures compound the significant interest of every organization that ought to attain and maximize its operation per the set aims, goals, and objectives. According to Aziz and Shah (2021), Budgeting pertains to financial plans that entail cash flows and predictions for future use of capital based on financial estimates. The basic education act defines secondary schools, budgets to be prepared by the Board of management which has the mandate to manage school finance

as guided by the Ministry of Education (MOE). Due to disparities in school budgetary processes in both developed and developing countries it is essential to investigate the budgetary state of public secondary schools in Kenya.

This Study thus intended to analyze the state of budgetary processes in the first world countries, middle income countries and the third world countries. OECD (2018) identifies that the budget is crucial in secondary schools as it ensures appropriate planning, effective decision-making on control of school financial resources, robust organization of financial resources, and operative directing of school resources. In first world countries such as Singapore and the United States, budgetary processes and funding are centralized in the national Government and delegated to appropriate ministries for overall oversight. In most schools, school boards of management fail to adhere to budget discipline characterized by failure to comply with set rules and regulations governing school spending. Despite school managers being accountable for all accounting purposes and controlling school expenditure, it has grown to be a norm that they are never sanctioned due to violation of their administrative duties. This result in budgetary gaps such as embezzlement of funds and misappropriation of school funds a cycle that has persisted over the years. The outcome leads to significance loss of school budget framework which is the main source of guidance and direction of school revenues and expenditure. In addition, school budget management is usually faced with extreme corruption in budget management if the school oversight body has incompetent members. Corruption has been reported to be a major challenge in school budget management where school tenders are awarded through bribery, over quotation of supplied goods and payments to ghost workers. This has been reported to be influenced by lack of adequate educational qualification and administrative experience of school board of management members in school budgetary systems.

Public organizations such as schools are mandated to provide Education and services to the school stakeholders and society. School budgets aim to clearly outline how the management intends to use the raised funds and government grants to attain educational goals effectively. Lack of adequate level of educational qualification impacts budgetary systems among school board of managers which results in to inefficient monitoring, poor expenditure commitment and recordings. In Germany, Sidki, Boerger and Boll (2023) identifies that education and experience have no effect in the overall success of state-owned enterprises and thus the necessity to diversify their research on school boards to find if there exist a correlation. A survey conducted by Khan et al (2023) on board diversity on firm performance in Pakistan identifies that there exists a constructive relationship between educational qualification and performance of firms. According to Salazar (2023) on his study on Board Competence for fiduciary governance responsibilities; basis for competence and fiduciary enhancement programs in southern Asia pacific region identifies that there is a strong correlation between education competence and fiduciary governance responsibilities.

In South Africa, Nxumalo et al, (2021) establish that school boards experience challenges in school financial management. The study revealed that there exist roles overlap among school stakeholders which was highlighted by incompetence in school financial management due to high level of illiteracy among SGB members. In Ghana, Manu et al, (2020) identifies that the board of management are not efficient in supervising and management of school finance in senior high schools as Board of Management members lack adequate education and thus the government should provide essential education and training to Board of Management members to enable them perform their duties effectively. According to Amadi (2020) academic qualification influences the performance level of B.O.M members in executing the school administrative roles.

In the USA, Hall (2023) analyzed control and capacity in superintendents-school boards relations in locally controlled districts and found that rural board capacity- residency, tenure of board members and experience influence local control. These studies differ with a survey conducted in Asia by Sutaguna et al, (2023) in Indonesia on the effects of work experience, work environment and discipline on employee's performance who found that there is negative relationship between work experience and employee performance. Appropriate Experience forms the backbone to successful implementation of school projects and budgets thus prior experience in financial management is crucial in the budgetary systems within the schools. The experience level of school board members lowers or increases the rate of involvement in the financial management and decision-making processes in schools.

Njini et al (2022) argues that in most public schools in Zimbabwe, the school boards members comprise of the clergy and noble men within the society who in most circumstances lack experience in affairs of the school budget. Accordingly, Lack of experience derails appropriate school budgeting as members of the board are unable to correct deviations and adjust the budget to cater for priorities in occurrence of changes in income and expenditure projections. In Tanzania effectiveness of the school boards have been found to be hindered by experience as most members of the boards lack experience in management of school budgets and knowledge of school budget formulation. Nelius and Onyango (2022) identifies that school managers should have appropriate experience in management of school resources. According to a study conducted by Odidi, (2020) on the Board of management practices affecting school project completion rate in Rachuonyo north sub-county in Kenya revealed that there is a correlation between Board of Management project planning, resource mobilization, project supervision, and stakeholder involvement; and adequate education, experience and training in the successful completion of school projects which vary among different schools Board of Management.

Locally in Kenya, the management of public funds is defined in Legal notice no 34. The legal notice no 34 establish the public finance management act no 18 of 2012 of the constitution of Kenya 2010. The act outlines the criteria for administration of public funds at the national and county level. It outlines the constitutional principles and responsibilities of public officers mandated to manage public resources who are answerable to the public through county assemblies and the parliament. According to the act the national treasury manages public funds at the national level with mandates to monitor, implement and promote macroeconomic policies involving expenditures and revenues. The public finance act 2015 outlines public finance management board to comprise of the national treasury, controller of budget, auditor general and internal auditors to oversee management of public funds at the national and county level. As defined in the Basic Education Act 2013, the school board of management operates under A semi-autonomous government agency 'the county education boards (CEB)' which is vested the responsibility to oversee the operations of the school management boards. The fourth schedule of basic education act thus states the composition of school boards to include teachers, parents' teachers' association (PTA) chairperson representing the parents, sponsor and the principal as the secretary of the board. The act stipulates the qualifications of members of school management boards not to be below O level.

In public secondary schools, ineffective budgetary systems and coordination between different budgetary systems contribute to failure in achieving the educational goals. This contributes to poor financial management in schools that leads to failure of short and strategic goals of the school attributed to low levels of education and lack of experience among school board members. The government of Kenya thus established KEMI under the ministry of education science and technology (MOEST) as a capacity building agency. KEMI was founded in 1981 as Kenya Education Staff Institute (KESI) to conduct staff training. KEMI trains all officers in managerial and administrative positions in education sector through providing in-service training and offer skills in mentoring, monitoring and evaluation. The BOM members must thus possess qualities established in the basic education act 2013 to effectively manage school funds which is not usually apprehended. The public audit act 2015 outlines the functions of the auditor general and their mandates to audit all public entities to establish whether public funds are used in the most effective way. At the county level the county auditor audits public schools' financial report to ascertain if public funds are used appropriately as defined by law each financial year. This study investigates how effective budgetary processes in schools can be implemented in accordance to basic education act 2013 in regard to educational qualification and administrative experience.

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

2.1: The concept of effective Budgetary processes

Budgetary processes demand effective planning, implementation, monitoring, controlling and evaluation of the school budget to guarantee that it meets the anticipated educational outcomes. According to Govindarajan (2019), budgetary processes are usually time-consuming as they require a detailed systemic analysis of expected revenue and expenditure over a given period and may be on a short or long-term basis. Schools as organizations, therefore, adopt a budgetary process defined by the school's educational needs, goals, and objectives. In essence, it is crucial to establish activities to be carried out within the school and instigating plans to source revenue for

such activities which should give a vote head of each estimated source a process which has been ineffective in public secondary schools across the globe. The financial mismanagement in budgetary processes can be attributed to level of education and administrative experience which relates to individual members of the school governing boards which are characterized by incompleteness of school projects, poor performance of school, misappropriation of school funds and unattainable output of quality education. This has been influenced by the following individual characteristics among BOM members.

2.2: Education level of Board of Management members and the School Budgetary processes

Educational level and qualifications are significant in determining the success rate of every organization. Organizations whose members pose a low level of education and academic qualification usually take long to implement their plans and hardly attain their set objectives. Lack of adequate level of educational qualification impacts budgetary systems among school boards of managers which results in inefficient monitoring, expenditure commitment and recordings. According to Salazar (2023) higher education institutions' success is determined by board of trustees in implementing the institutional goals and objectives. The researcher identifies that there exists an educational gap where board of trustee's members are not well acquainted with knowledge about their roles in legal liability, governance affairs, leadership succession plans, board meeting, code of conduct for members and package information about the school. In addition, Salazar (2023) states that school executives and board of trustee leadership should commit to offer opportunities for trustee education through training and development which will enhance their professional skills in strategic planning, policy making and problem solving.

Based on a survey conducted by Khan et al (2023) on board diversity on firm performance in Pakistan from Resource-Based view perspective evidence identifies that there exists a constructive relationship among educational qualification and performance of firms. The survey used Resource-Based view theory and extracted data from Pakistan stock exchange of (2009-2020). The study identified that board diversity strands such as gender, age, ethnicity and educational qualifications influence the overall performance of firms in Pakistan. The researcher identifies that Board of Management education level plays a crucial role in competitive advantage and most importantly in making strategic decisions. Board of Management with high level of education enhances its ability to innovatively solve complex problems and improve financial performance.

In Germany, Sidki, Boerger and Boll (2023) identifies that education and experience have no effect in the overall success of state-owned enterprises. He identifies that the appointment process of state-owned enterprises board members (SOEs) is usually based on political interest and affiliation where expertise and educational qualification is not necessarily the determinant perform worse and hardly make progress. The study established that educational level and experience does not have any influence on financial performance where board members who have worked in the same position for more than one year are not different from newly joined members with less than one-year experience in matters of financial decision making. The researchers further asserts that recruited board members who have experience from other corporates may have knowledge that can do more harm than good as their experience might not be relevant to the SOEs and thus insignificant (Sidki, Boerger and Boll, 2023). In addition, he details that educational qualification influences performance of state owned cooperation's negatively as individuals with more qualification are faced with overconfidence bias and may generalize their personal experiences in decisions of the organization thus posing to difficulties in progression of SOEs.

Across the African continent, education level has always lagged behind in most states as nations are unable to cater for education demands due to conflicting developmental interests and low capitation to finance their annual budgets. Nxumalo et al (2021) studied involvement of school governing bodies and their influence in promoting educators and school systems in South Africa. The study revealed that there exist roles overlap among school stakeholders which was highlighted by incompetence in school governing bodies and high level of illiteracy level among SGB members. In Ghana, Manu et al, (2020) conducted a study to investigate school boards efficiency in management of human resource and finance in senior high school in Ashanti region. Based on the finding of the study, it was reported that the board of management are not efficient in management and supervision of school finance in senior high schools. The research outlines that school management board members lack adequate education and thus the government should provide essential education and training to

Board of Management members to capacitate them for efficient execution of their mandates. The study further establishes that membership of Board of Management members should be based on financial literacy with emphasis on capabilities to control school finance.

Despite Kenya being a lower middle-income country, level of education has been found to be a prevalent course of failure in management of school finances. This can be attributed to the failure of effectively implementing the basic education act 2013 which outlines guidelines and principals governing the School Boards of Management. According to a study by Amadi (2020) on Personal Related Factors Influencing Boards of Management Performance in Public Secondary Schools in Vihiga Sub- County, Kenya. In regard to the findings of the survey, academic qualification influences the performance of Board of Management. The Study comprised ten principals, 10 Board of Management chairpersons, 10 PTA chairpersons and SCQASO members from 28 schools, totaling 31 respondents. The study revealed that members of the Board of Management with high level of professional and academic qualification were more effective in executing their functions as they clearly understood their roles and responsibilities. The disparities in education level can be attributed to the basic education act (2013), which only sets the minimum threshold for Board of Management membership and does not define an adequate level of Education to be used during their appointment and thus may derail budgetary activities in schools.

2.3: Administrative Experience of Board of Management members on school Budgetary process

Experience is vital in executing recurrent affairs affecting organization at different periods of time. Members of the school boards with experience on performance of the financial affairs are best suited to make effective decisions for both short- and long-term goals based on the prevailing financial status. In the United States of America (USA), Hall (2023) analyzed control and capacity in superintendents-school boards relations in locally controlled districts. The researcher examined factors that shape local control by school boards and how they influence superintendents school board relations using local will and capacity theory. The survey adopted qualitative case study design and used *vivo*, *priori* coding and creation of analytic matrices for data analysis. The research established that there existed local will and local capacity which influenced local control. The survey found that rural board capacity- residency, tenure of board members and expertise influence local control. The survey identifies that local control-school board relationship typology is characterized by board capacity confusion, role contestation, dependence, and collaboration.

In Asia, a survey led by Sutaguna et al, (2023) in Indonesia found that there is negative relationship of work experience and employee performance. The survey used census method to select the study population and used interviews, observations and questionnaires for data collection. However, the researcher's detail that work experience has a great potential in enhancing person's ability to excel in performance only if the gained experience is positive. The study concluded that work experience gained by office employees at Makassar Megaputra Prima Telkomsel Distribution Center Makassar has no positive outcomes on performance since their experience only remind them of more tasks that they have done and thus are not much competent on new tasks that have been assigned.

Across the African continent, Hang'andu (2022) in Zambia identified that; most of the school finance committees lack experience as they are unable to distinguish their roles with those of the school finance officers. Based on the research, the researcher states that there exists an overlap of roles in school financial management affairs which causes confusion and misunderstanding leading to ineffective financial management in schools. In addition, the study reports that disregard to bureaucratic procedures and patterns, lack of knowledge in financial management and lack of induction of members after being elected to financial committees pose a major challenge in financial management in schools.

Accordingly, Lack of experience derails appropriate school budgeting as members of the board are unable to correct deviations and adjust the budget to cater for priorities in occurrence of changes in income and expenditure projections. In Tanzania effectiveness of the school boards have been found to be hindered by experience as most members of the boards lack experience in management of school budgets and knowledge of school budget formulation. Nelius and Onyango (2022) conducted a study to investigate difficulties headteachers face in

controlling school finances in public secondary in Bukombe District. The study used purposive sampling and simple random techniques to gather data from the identified samples. Based on the study findings, school principals and school board members lack effective budgetary skills and experience in school management. The study established that school principals are selected by regional administrative council without scrutiny on their prior knowledge in budgeting processes, accounting and experience in school leadership.

In Kenya, experience has been a major concern not only in matters of education but across varied disciplines which demand individuals to be experienced in affairs of conducting organizational business. In Kenyan schools, experience has been found to be of major influence in performance of the schools across different avenues. A study conducted by (Odidi,2020) on the influence of management boards practices on completion of a school project in Rachuonyo north sub-county in Kenya revealed that there is a correlation between Board of Management project planning, resource mobilization, project supervision, and stakeholder involvement, and adequate education, experience and training in the successful completion of school projects. According to the Study, principals with more than six years of management of schools could carry out their mandates effectively. As accorded in the Study, management practices of Board of Management can be influenced by BOM member's factors, thus making it substantive to investigate how B.O.M level of education and administrative experience may influence the budgetary processes.

2.4: Theoretical framework

The Study used systems theory to understand how individual factors influence budgetary processes in secondary schools. Systems theory is an interdisciplinary study of cohesive, interdependent systems that can be natural or human-made. According to Van Assche et al (2019), a system is a structured set of theories, ideas or a particular way of doing things. It can also be considered a group of things, elements, pieces of equipment, or parts that are connected or work together to form a complex whole. The general system theory can be traced back to Ludwig Von Bertalanffy, a German scholar who lived between 1901-1972 (Van Assche et al., 2019). The theory was founded by Ludwig Von Bertalanffy during his research on general systems in an engineering plant in 1940s and 1950s in the United States of America. System theory makes assumption that a complex system is made up of significant smaller systems and that the interaction of these smaller systems is what makes up the complexity of any given system.

The system theory analyzes the patterns and studies how different components work for overall success. In school, it would be better to identify the patterns resulting from a phenomenon rather than making a conclusion before appropriate analysis. For instance, changing the school board members does not mean that the school will have effective budgetary processes if the causes and components analysis contributing to ineffective budgetary processes is not made. The general system theory makes it possible to bring out the interactions between subsystems involved in budgetary activities such as in planning, implementing, controlling, and evaluating the school budget. The budget planning process, as described, can be short-term, middle-term, or long-term. The implementation process usually involves all coordination of events and activities to ensure the success of the organizational goals and objectives as a whole.

The systems theory applies to this Study as schools are run by systems that harmoniously interact and revolve around financial management for effective school operations. As articulated by scholars, Board of Management are mandated to facilitate effective management of school finances. Over the years, Board of Management members have engaged in activities such as, training, benchmarking, team building, and attending seminars and workshops to improve their financial management status. In secondary schools, Board of Management members actively participate in managerial functions of the school, which include checking books of accounts and monitoring educational programmes. Besides, the annual school plan is based on financial resources that require effectively costed departmental budgets. Thus, Board of Management must be very effective in drawing the plans and allocating resources to facilitate the achievement of such plans. It is the Board of Management mandate to monitor the progress of the strategies to ascertain if the set targets are achieved. This might include the construction of new classrooms, libraries, laboratories, and school perimeter walls, among other activities.

The expenditure incurred should be discussed during the board meeting and trial balances prepared. The Board of Management is also mandated to regulate, control school fees and make payments to school support staff. As required by the Ministry of Education, Board of Management must submit accounting books for the county

annual audit to county educational board and discuss with the school stakeholders the school's financial status. For effective performance in secondary school budgetary processes and financial management, the Board of Management members must be experienced, educated, and well-trained. Ludwig Von Bertalanffy systems theory is thus appropriate for this study as it will facilitate analysis of how different components interact harmoniously to facilitate effectiveness in budgetary processes in schools.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND STUDY PARADIGM

This Study used mixed method approach by use of both qualitative and quantitative methods. Descriptive survey design and correlation analysis were applied in making statistical inferences of the obtained data. The descriptive survey and correlation analysis design attempts to collect data from population members to establish the population's status using one or more variables. Mashali et al. (2019) associate Descriptive survey design with a design that purports to describe a phenomenon accurately by critically analyzing how different variables interact within the population. The Study targeted 32 public secondary schools, 416 Board of Management members, 32 principals, 1 (one) county auditor and 160 teachers in the Kangundo sub county. The total participants of the study comprised of 12 principals and 1 county auditor selected through purposive sampling to collect interviews data while 83 Board of Management members and 32 teachers were identified using stratified random sampling to collect data through questionnaires. The Study used self-administered questionnaires and interview schedules to gather data from participants. The questions were composed of both open-ended and closed-ended questions. The Study involved the administration of two questionnaires for Board of Management members and teachers. The questionnaires used was based on five point Likert scale Whereby 5= SA Strongly agree; , 4= A-Agree; 3= UD-Undecided; 2= D-Disagree and 1= SD- Strongly disagree. Ethical consideration was apprehended where the researcher presented a research permit and informed consent to participants and confirmed that the study participation was voluntary and the obtained data would only be used for the purposes of the study.

Instruments validity refers to measurement of accuracy. Connelly (2022) states that Validity establishes how a specific test is suitable for a particular situation. Instruments validities were ascertained by Supervisors both of the department of educational management, policy, and curriculum studies. The Experts advised the researcher on the corrections needed to be made to the instruments to ensure that they are in line with the study objectives. Reliability measures consistency in which a study yields consistent results on repetitive trials (Connelly 2022). The researcher conducted a pilot study in a nearby sub county and applied the test-retest technique, which involves administering the research instruments twice to the selected participants after two weeks to consider whether there is consistency in responses. The score from the first test were correlated with the final test scores. The survey applied Pearson's product-moment correlation coefficient to establish the degree of consistency and correlation among the study variables and establish whether there is positive correlation between the independent and dependent variables. The obtained data value was split in to two using odd and even number values to get two data sets that were correlated to establish the existing relationship. The researcher coded the obtained data to translate responses from the questionnaires and interviews into particular categories. The coded data was then transmitted and entered into statistical package for social sciences (SPSS) computer software for analysis and data presentation.

4.1: Education level of B.O.M members and the School Budgetary processes

The researcher sought to examine the Board of Management educational level influence on school budgetary processes. Frequencies, percentages, Means and Standard Deviation were utilized in analysing Descriptive statistics. They were expected to indicate their responses on a five-point Likert's scale whereby 5= SA Strongly agree; 4= A-Agree; 3= UD-Undecided; 2= D-Disagree, 1= SD- Strongly disagree. The mean score of the Likert scale items on teachers' and BOM occupation responses was computed in order to make comparisons. From the summated scores, mean was computed ranging from 0 to 5. (Lee, 1999; Bademo and Ferede, 2016; Petronilla, 2018) indicates that a mean of below 2.00 is termed low, mean between 2 to 3.5 is moderate whereas a mean of 3.5 to 5 is regarded high.

Responses from B.O.Ms and Teachers

The study sought to establish B.O.Ms views on their education level and school budgetary processes.

Table 1: B.O.Ms responses on B.O.Ms educational level on school budgetary processes

Statement	5		4		2		1		Mean	Sd
	f	%	f	%	f	%	f	%		
I have education below O level	12	15	2	3	16	21	48	62	2	2
I have an O level education	4	5	14	18	20	26	40	51	2	1
I have a college diploma education	62	80	10	13	4	5	2	3	5	1
I have university education	22	28	2	3	18	23	36	46	2	2
Average Mean									3	1

Table 1 indicates that 12(15%) of B.O.M strongly agreed that they have education below O level and 2(3%) agreed while 16(21%) disagreed and the greatest number 48(62%) strongly disagreed with a mean of ($M=2$, $SD=2$). None of the members were undecided. This implies that most B.O.Ms were able to effectively understand the budgetary processes because of their education. This was in disagreement with Asiago as cited by Kalungu (2015) who observed that B.O.M lacked prerequisite qualification on financial matters to enable them execute their mandates appropriately. On whether they have O level education 4(5%) of the B.O.M strongly agreed while 14(18%) agreed; 20(26%) disagreed while the majority 40(51%) strongly disagreed with this statement with a mean of ($M=2$, $SD=1$). None of the members were undecided. This implies that the majority of the B.O.M members did not have an O level education since it was still below the required qualification for one to be recruited as a B.O.M which would affect the budgetary process. This was in disagreement with the findings of Mobegi, Ondigi, and Simatwa, (2012) cited by Savuli (2018) who argue that most B.O.M members have educational qualification below the required threshold of O level in contrast with the Basic education act 2013 guidelines.

On whether they have college diploma education majority 62(80%) of the B.O.M strongly agreed while 10(13%) agreed, 4(5%) disagreed and 2(3%) strongly disagreed with a mean of ($M=5$, $SD=1$). This implies that most B.O.M members had the required qualification to be a B.O.M member thus were able to effectively understand and implement budgetary processes in school.

On whether they had university education 22(28%) of the B.O.M strongly agreed while 2(3%) agreed while 18(23%) disagreed and the majority 36(46%) strongly disagreed respectively with a mean of ($M=2$, $SD=2$). The findings of this survey were in agreement with that of Sadia (2017) on her survey on establishing factors that influence income-generating projects in public secondary schools who point out that personal qualification plays a significant part in the management and planning of income-generating sources of finance in secondary schools. As accorded in the study, inadequate professional qualification impacts the state of management and planning of income-generating ventures in schools and thus the study can be diversified in establishing how qualification impacts budgetary processes in schools. This implies that few of the B.O.M. had a university degree which also was important in assisting during the budgetary process in schools.

Table 2: Teachers' response on B.O.Ms educational level on school budgetary processes

Statement	5		4		2		1		Mean	Sd
	f	%	f	%	f	%	f	%		
I am educated up to O level	6	19	1	3	4	13	21	66	2	2

I have college diploma	1	3	2	6	10	31	19	59	2	1
I have a university degree	27	84	3	9	1	3	1	3	5	1
I have education past degree level (masters and PHD)	9	28	1	3	8	25	14	44	3	2
Average Mean									3	1

Table 2 shows 21(66%) of teachers strongly disagreed that they are educated up to O level while 6(19%) strongly agreed and 4(13%) disagreed and 1(3%) agreed respectively with a mean of ($M=2$, $SD=2$). This implies that most teachers were educated beyond O level. The findings are in line with MOEST, (2005) who assert that being a person of integrity, committed to serve the community voluntarily and having a minimum qualification of O level, qualifies an individual as a BOM member. On whether they have college diploma education majority 19(59%) of the teachers strongly disagreed while 10(31%) disagreed and 2(6%) agreed and 1(3%) strongly agreed respectively with a mean of ($M=2$, $SD=1$). This implies that most teachers in secondary did not have a college diploma education. The findings concur with Mobegi, Ondigi & Simatwa, (2012) who asserts that lack of necessary technical skills, inability to interpret financial reports and incompetence in decision making processes are challenges facing BOM members.

On whether they have university degree the majority 27(84%) of the teachers strongly agreed while 3(9%) agreed and 3(9%) agreed, 1(3%) both strongly disagreed and disagreed with a mean of ($M=5$, $SD=1$). This implies the teachers had the required minimum qualification to be a secondary school teacher hence were able to understand the school budgetary process. In addition, the basic act regulation requires that BOM chairpersons must have a degree qualification, pose no business interest with the school and be a person of integrity. The findings concur with Kalungu (2015) who indicates that the nature of the job done, gender, level of education and professional status and of Board of Management members influence BOMs financial management effectiveness. On whether they have education past degree level (master's and PhD) 14(44%) of the teachers strongly disagreed while 9(28%) agreed and 8(25%) disagreed while 1(3%) strongly agreed respectively with a mean of ($M=3$, $SD=1$). This implies that many educators have done a masters or PhD thus enabling them be well conversant with budgetary processes in school.

Based on principals' interviews, they reported that educational level influenced Board of Management members in school budgetary processes with most of them stating that the higher the educational qualification the higher the competence. The principals stated that education level influenced board members level of understanding on articulating matters of great concerns in school budgeting in ensuring that the school budget meets targets. Majority of the principals stated that BOM members had education qualification above O level which made them effectively participate in school budgetary processes. Besides, principals stated that the greatest number of BOM members had college degree which made them understand the school budgetary cycle thus they were able to understand every stage of school budgetary process. Principals further ascertained that education level was significant in determining how board members were able to critically evaluate different aspects of school budgetary processes from planning to evaluation. Nevertheless, school principals stated that level of education among BOM members was of great essence as it made them understand budgetary matters and dynamics of school budgeting patterns. These findings concur with Myende, Samuel and Pillay, (2018) on principal's competence analysis of professionalism in school funds management for accountability purposes. The survey identified that school funds accountability was enhanced by competence in budgeting. This is an indication that headteachers and BOM members who enhance their budgetary skills are more likely to improve their accountability on school finance. The county auditor further indicated that educational level is key in determining effectiveness of school board members portrayed by their ability to articulate and understand issues of school budgetary processes and overall school management.

The researcher applied Pearson product moment correlation and inferential statistics to analyse the Research objective. Objective three was tested using Pearson product moment correlation to test the connection linking Board of Management professional training and school budgetary processes. To test objective three Pearson product-moment correlation was done to determine the relationship between Board of Management educational level ($M=2.69$, $SD=1.31$) and school budgetary processes ($M=3.17$, $SD=1.38$).

Table 3: Correlation between B.O. Ms Education level and school budgetary processes

		Board of Management educational level	School Budgetary processes
Board of Management educational level	Pearson Correlation	1	.665*
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.000
	N	78	78
School Budgetary processes	Pearson Correlation	.665*	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	
	N	78	78
*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).			

The correlation result in Table 3 indicates a positive and strong significant coefficient between Board of Management educational level and School Budgetary processes. The results on Table 3 ($r(76)=0.665$, $p<0.000$). was rejected at $p<0.05$ significance level. Hence there is a relationship between Board of Management educational level and School Budgetary processes. This implies that when Board of Management have a high educational level and thus the school budgetary processes is effectively done. These findings concur with research by Manu et al, (2020) conducted to investigate school boards human resource and financial management efficiency in public senior high school in Ashanti region. Based on the finding of the study, it was reported that the board of management lack capacity in management and supervision of school finance in senior high schools. The survey established that Board of Management members lack adequate education and thus the government should provide essential education and training to Board of Management members to empower them perform their duties effectively (Manu et al, 2020).

4.2 Administrative Experience of Board of Management Members on School Budgetary Process

The researcher ought to determine the influence of the Board of Management administrative experience on school budgetary processes. Frequencies, percentages, Means and Standard Deviation were utilized in descriptive statistics. They were expected to indicate their responses on a five-point Likert's scale Whereby 5= SA Strongly agree; 4= A-Agree; 3= UD-Undecided; 2= D-Disagree, 1= SD- Strongly disagree. The mean score of the Likert scale items on teachers' and BOM occupation responses was computed in order to make comparisons. From the summated scores, mean was computed ranging from 0 to 5. (Lee, 1999: Bademo and Ferede,2016; Petronilla,2018) indicates that a mean of below 2.00 is termed low, mean between 2 to 3.5 is moderate whereas as mean of 3.5 to 5 is regarded high.

Responses from B.O.Ms and Teachers

The study sought to establish B.O.Ms views on their administrative experience and school budgetary processes.

Table 4: B.O.Ms response on administrative experience and school budgetary processes

Statement	5		4		2		1		Mean	Sd
	f	%	f	%	f	%	f	%		
I have more than one-year experience in budgetary processes	21	27	32	41	9	12	16	21	3	2
I have one-year experience in budgetary processes	35	45	21	27	20	26	2	3	2	1
I have less than one-year experience in budgetary processes	10	13	8	10	21	27	39	50	2	1
I have no experience in budgetary processes	19	24	6	8	7	9	46	59	2	2
Average Mean									3	1

Table 4 shows that the majority 21(27%) of B.O.M strongly agreed that they have more than one-year experience in budgetary processes while 32(41%) agreed, only 9(12%) and 16(21%) disagreed and strongly disagreed respectively with a mean of ($M=3$, $SD=2$). This implies that most B.O.M members had a vast experience in the budgetary processes since they have been members in the B.O.M for some time. On whether they have one-year experience in budgetary processes the majority 35(45%) of the B.O.M strongly agreed while 21(27%) agreed, a population of 20(26%) and 2(3%) disagreed and strongly disagreed respectively with a mean of ($M=2$, $SD=1$). This denotes that the highest number of the B.O.M members had one year experience in the budgetary processes. On whether they have less than one-year experience in budgetary processes 10(13%) of the B.O.M members strongly agreed while 8(10%) agreed, 21(27%) disagreed while the majority 39(50%) strongly disagreed with a mean of ($M=2$, $SD=1$). This implies that most B.O.M members did not have less than one-year experience in budgetary processes in school. On whether they have no experience in budgetary processes 19(24%) of the B.O.M strongly agreed while 6(8%) agreed, a population of 7(9%) disagreed and the majority 46(59%) strongly disagreed with a mean of ($M=2$, $SD=2$). This implies that few of the B.O.M. had a no experience in budgetary processes although some did not have any experience in the budgetary process in schools. The findings of this survey agree with that of Kingi (2015) on challenges facing school board of management members in management of public secondary school in Kamwangi district which establish that experience is a major influencing management of school finances (Kingi, 2015). The findings concur with Kalungu, (2015) who found that newly appointed BOM members' competency may be influenced by inexperience, inadequate exposure, low education and inappropriate induction on their roles and responsibilities. Table 4.24 shows Teachers' response on the influence of Board of Management educational level on school budgetary processes.

Table 5 Teachers' response on administrative experience and school budgetary processes

Statement	5		4		2		1		Mean	Sd
	f	%	f	%	f	%	f	%		
I have more than one-year experience in budgetary processes	16	50	7	22	3	9	6	19	3	2
I have one-year experience in budgetary processes	16	50	9	28	6	19	1	3	2	1

I have less than one-year experience in budgetary processes	5	16	3	9	7	22	17	53	2	2
I have no experience in budgetary processes	10	31	3	9	2	6	17	53	3	2
Average Mean									2	2

Table 5 shows 16(50%) of teachers strongly agreed that they have more than one-year experience in budgetary processes while 7(22%) agreed and 3(9%) disagreed and 6(19%) strongly disagreed respectively with a mean of ($M=3$, $SD=2$). This implies that most teachers have more than one-year experience in budgetary processes. The findings were in disagreement with Nombasa (2014), who found that members of school governing boards lack capacity in formulating budgets drafts, policy statements, financial reports, accountability, control of finance and petty cash evaluation. This was linked to illiteracy and poor training activities of board members. On whether they have one-year experience in budgetary processes majority 16(50%) of the teachers strongly agreed while 9(28%) agreed and 6(19%) disagreed and 1(3%) strongly disagreed respectively with a mean of ($M=2$, $SD=1$). This implies that most teachers have one years' experience in budgetary process. On whether they have less than one-year experience in budgetary processes 5(16%) of the teachers strongly agreed while 3(9%) agreed and 7(22%) disagreed and the majority 17(53%) strongly disagreed with a mean of ($M=2$, $SD=2$). This implies that most teachers did not have less than one-year experience in budgetary processes in school.

On whether they have no experience in budgetary processes 10(31%) of the teachers strongly agreed and 3(9%) agreed while 2(6%) disagreed and the majority 17(53%) strongly disagreed with a mean of ($M=3$, $SD=2$). This implies that some teachers had no experience in budgetary processes in school while others had.

As ascertained by principals during the interviews, administrative experience influenced the level of BOM members performance. Most principals stated that they had more than one year's experience in school budgetary process which made them more expertise since they have attended many schools' budgetary meetings. The principals further asserted that administrative experience influenced school budgeting to a very large and was vital since it ensured that unnecessary mistakes are avoided. The principals further expounded that BOM members had gaps in administrating school budgets due to lack of experience which negatively impacts the budgetary patterns. The principals indicated that BOM members lack adequate skills and understanding on school budgetary processes and thus frequent refresher courses should be organized for them to increase their effectiveness. In addition, principals stated that Board members with more experience are effective in providing rational decisions in matters of school budgetary processes. Nevertheless, the county auditor stated that BOM administrative experience was vital in ensuring that sound decisions are made in regard to school budgetary processes.

The researcher used Pearson product moment correlation and inferential statistics to analyse the Research objective. Objective four was tested using Pearson product moment correlation to test the relationship between Board of Management administrative experience and school budgetary processes. To test objective four Pearson product-moment correlation was done to determine the connection among Board of Management administrative experience ($M=2$, $SD=2$) and school budgetary processes ($M=3$, $SD=1$).

Table 6: Correlation between B.O.Ms administrative experience and school budgetary processes

		Board of Management administrative experience	School Budgetary processes
Board of Management administrative experience	Pearson Correlation	1	.479*
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.000

	N	78	78
School Budgetary processes	Pearson Correlation	.479*	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	
	N	78	78
*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).			

The results on Table 6 ($r(76) = 0.479, p < 0.000$) was rejected at $p < 0.05$ significance level implying that there was a positive and moderate correlation between Board of management administrative experience and school budgetary processes. This implies that when Board of Management have a long administrative experience, they are well aware of how the school budgetary processes is done thus the school budgetary processes is effectively and promptly done. These findings were consistent with research study conducted by (Odidi,2020) on Board of management practices on the completion of a school project in the Rachuonyo north sub-county in Kenya revealed that there is a correlation between Board of Management project planning, resource mobilization, project supervision, and stakeholder involvement, and adequate education, experience and training in the successful completion of school projects.

DISCUSSIONS

The study focused on establishing the influence of the Board of Management level of education and administrative experience on school Budgetary processes in public secondary schools in Kangundo sub-county Machakos county.

5.1: BOM level of education and School Budgetary processes

The study established that there is positive, moderate and significant association on B.O.M members level of education and school budgetary processes in public secondary schools in Kangundo sub county in Machakos county. This was attributed to a correlation of $R = 0.665$ and $P < 0.000$. The results indicate that budgetary processes in Kangundo sub county schools were highly relatable with Board members level of Education. This was influenced by the fact that school have recruited board members who have appropriate educational prerequisite as defined in Basic education act 2013. Increasing in the numbers of training and induction seminars also contributed to effectiveness in school budgetary systems. The findings of the study concur with those of Salazar (2023) in Southern Asian region who identified that there exists an educational gap in where board of trustee's members are not well acquainted with knowledge about their roles in legal liability, governance affairs, leadership succession plans, board meeting, code of conduct for members and package information about the school. The findings of the survey agree with that of khan et al (2023) who identified that board diversity strands such as gender, age, ethnicity and educational qualifications influences the overall performance of firms in Pakistan. Khan et al (2023) in assert that education level is highly significant in improvising firms' performance and competitive advantage. The findings of the survey concur with that of Nxumalo (2021) who revealed that that there exist roles overlap among school stakeholders which was highlighted by incompetence in school governing bodies due to high level of illiteracy level among SGB members (Nxumalo et al ,2021).

Besides, the survey agrees with that of Manu et al (2020) who identified that that school management board members lack adequate education and thus the government should provide essential education and training to Board of Management members to capacitate them for efficient execution of their mandates. The findings concur with Mobegi, Ondigi & Simatwa, (2012) who asserts that lack of necessary technical skills, inability to interpret financial reports and incompetence in decision making processes are challenges facing BOM members. The findings agree with Kalungu (2015) who indicates that the nature of the job done, gender, level of education and professional status of Board of Management members influence BOMs financial management effectiveness. In

contrast, the survey contradicts survey by Sidki, Boerger and Boll (2023) who details that educational qualification influences performance of state owned cooperations negatively as individuals with more qualification are faced with overconfidence bias and may generalize their personal experiences in decisions of the organization thus posing to difficulties in progression of SOEs.

5.2: BOM administrative experience and School Budgetary process

The study established that there is positive, moderate and significant association on B.O.M members administrative experience and school budgetary processes in public secondary schools in Kangundo sub county in Machakos county. This was attributed to a correlation of $R=0.479$ and $P<0.000$. The indication was that school that have board members with lengthy experience in budgetary systems performed well in budgeting of school resources. This was attributed to increased training and seminars which focuses on capacity building of School board members in management of school budgets organized by the ministry of Education in conjunction with County educational boards. The findings of the survey concur with that of Hall (2023) who found that rural board capacity- residency, tenure of board members and expertise influence local control. The survey identifies that local control-school board relationship typology is characterized by board capacity confusion, role contestation, dependence, and collaboration. The findings agree with that of Hang'andu (2022) who identified that most of the school finance committees lack experience as they are unable to distinguish their roles with those of the school finance officers and that there exists an overlap in roles on school financial management affairs which causes confusion and misunderstanding leading to ineffective financial management in schools. The findings of the survey further agree with that of Nelius and Onyango, (2022) who found that school principals and school board members lack effective budgetary skills and experience in school management. The study agrees with that of Odidi (2020) who revealed that there is a correlation between Board of Management project planning, resource mobilization, project supervision, and stakeholder involvement, and adequate education, experience and training in the successful completion of school projects.

The survey findings agree with Ntsele (2014), who found that members of school governing boards lack capacity in formulating budgets drafts, policy statements, financial reports, accountability, control of finance and petty cash evaluation. This was linked to illiteracy and poor training activities of board members. The findings of this survey agree with that of Kingi (2015) on challenges facing school board of management members in management of public secondary school in Kamwangi district which establish that experience is a major influencing management of school finances. Besides the study findings contravenes that of Sidki, Boerger and Boll, (2023) who identified that education and experience have no effect in the overall success of state-owned enterprises. Nevertheless, the findings contradict that of Sutaguna et al, (2023) in Indonesia on effects of work experience, work environment and discipline on employee's performance who found that there is negative relationship of work experience and employee performance.

CONCLUSION

The study concludes that Board of management level of education and administrative experience influences school budgetary processes in making appropriate financial estimates, drafting clear and concise budgets, clearly planning the school resources, monitoring, implementation and evaluation of the school budget performance. The results posit that there is a strong moderate, positive and significant relationship on B.O.M members education level and school budgetary processes in public secondary schools in Kangundo sub county Machakos county. This was illustrated by a correlation of $R=0.665$ and $P<0.000$. The existing correlation signifies that education level have positive influence on B.O.M members capacity in school budgetary processes where increase in education increases B.O.M Budgetary effectiveness in schools.

Besides, the research remarks that there exists a positive correlation between B.O.M members experience and school budgetary processes in public secondary schools in Kangundo sub-county Machakos county. This is proved at $R=0.479$ and $P<0.000$. This is attributed to appointment of board members who have served in other boards who bring with them their prior expertise and knowledge hence contributing positively to school budgetary systems. This affirms that B.O.M members who have long term exposure on budgetary processes are more effective in school budgetary processes. The study had limitations which would influence generalisability

and interpretation of the finding as it relied on self-reported data from board of management members which may have been influenced by desirability bias. Besides, the research was limited to public secondary schools in Kangundo sub county making it difficult to generalise results to other type of schools and regions. In addition, the study focused on two variables, level of education and level of experience without considering other factors that influence budgetary processes in public secondary schools such as funding challenges and government policies.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR STUDY

1. The Ministry of Education (MoE) should carefully select Board of Management (B.O.M) members to ensure they possess appropriate educational qualifications and experience in managing human resources within educational institutions.
2. The government should train all B.O.M members in school financial management and provide sponsored, continuous, and progressive capacity-building programs to enhance their financial management skills.
3. The MoE should revise the minimum academic qualifications for B.O.M members, requiring at least a college diploma or higher, rather than assuming that O-Level education is sufficient for managing school finances.
4. The government should sponsor B.O.M members to engage with the Kenya Education Management Institute (KEMI) and become familiar with key management processes, including constitutional policies and evolving trends in information and communication technology (ICT).
5. The Ministry of Education, through County Education Boards, should strictly enforce regulations to ensure that all B.O.M members meet the minimum intellectual and professional qualifications required for effective school governance.
6. To enhance B.O.M members' competencies as school managers, there should be regular, well-structured training opportunities in areas such as policy interpretation, strategic planning, and financial management to improve efficiency and effectiveness in school budgetary processes.

REFERENCES

1. Amadi, E. S. (2020). Personal Related Factors Influencing Performance of Boards of Management of Public Secondary Schools in Vihiga Sub- County, Vihiga County, Kenya (Doctoral dissertation, University of Nairobi).
2. Aziz, H., & Shah, N. (2021). Participatory budgeting: Models and approaches. In *Pathways Between Social Science and Computational Social Science* (pp. 215-236). Springer, Cham.
3. Connelly, L. M. (2022). Measurement Instrument Validity. *Medsurg Nursing*, 31(1), 64-63.
4. Govindarajan, V. (2019). Impact of participation in the budgetary process on managerial attitudes and performance: Universalistic and contingency perspectives. In *Management Control Theory* (pp. 321-342). Routledge.
5. Hall Sutherland, D. (2023). Capacity and Control: Superintendent-School Board Relations in Locally Controlled Districts. *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 0013161X231159135.
6. Hang'andu, N. B. (2022). Modes and challenges of accountability and transparency in the financial management systems in grant aided schools: a case of Kasisi girls and Kafue boys secondary schools (Doctoral dissertation, The University of Zambia).
7. Kalungu, A. S. (2015). Influence of board of managements' financial management on public secondary schools in Westlands district, Nairobi County, Kenya (Doctoral dissertation, University of Nairobi).
8. Khan, I., Khan, I. U., Uddin, M. J., Khan, S. U., & Marwat, J. (2023). Diversity of Shari'ah supervisory board and the performance of Islamic banks: evidence from an emerging economy of Pakistan. *Journal of Islamic Accounting and Business Research*.
9. Kingi, P. M. (2018). Teachers' Participation in Management of Financial Resources and Motivation.
10. Manu, B. D., Zhang, H., Oduro, D., Krampah-Nkoom, A., Mensah, I. A., Anaba, O. A., & Isaac, A. (2020). School board efficiency in financial management and human resource in public senior high schools: An evidence from Ashanti region, Ghana. *Int'l J. Soc. Sci. Stud.*, 8, 79.

11. Mashali, B., Sheybani, H., Hajiani, E., & Ghanbari, A. (2019). Designing a Mixed Model for Human Resource Foresight in the Public Sector of IR Iran. *Public Management Researches*, 12(44), 79-105.
12. Mobegi, F., Ondigi, B., & Simatwa, E. (2012). Factors contributing to financial mismanagement and misappropriation in Public Secondary Schools in Gucha District, Kenya. *International Journal of Exclusive Management Research*, 2(5): 1-19.
13. MoEST (2005). Sessional Paper No. 1 of 2005. A policy Framework for Education, Training and Research. Government Printers. Nairobi.
14. Mutinda, K. P. (2015). Challenges facing board of managers in management of public secondary schools: Kamwingi District, Kenya. *Merit research journal of education and review*, 3(9), 285-291.
15. Myende, P. E., Samuel, M. A & Pillay, A. (2018). Novice Rural Principal's successful Leadership practices in Financial Management: Multiple Accountabilities. *South African journal of education*, Vol 38, Issue 2, pp1-11
16. Nelius, R., & Onyango, D. (2022). Challenges Facing School Heads in Controlling Finances among Bukombe District Public Secondary Schools, Tanzania. *Journal: EAST AFRICAN JOURNAL OF MANAGEMENT AND BUSINESS STUDIES* January to March, 2022(1), 1-6.
17. Njini, S., Assan, T. E. B., Patience, E. U., & Sithole, B. M. (2022). Behavioral Analysis of experiences of secondary School Development Committees on policies and practices in budgeting in Kwekwe District, Zimbabwe. *Gender and Behaviour*, 20(1), 19084-19101.
18. Ntsele, C. N. (2014). Accountability and Transparency in Managing School Finances at Primary Schools in Johannesburg South Africa (Doctoral dissertation, University of South Africa)
19. Nxumalo, T. M., Gamede, B. T., & Uleanya, C. (2021). Examining the Involvement of School Governing Bodies in Promoting Educators in South Africa.
20. Odidi, K. O., & Odidi, K. O. (2020). Influence of Board of Management Governance Practices on Completion of School Projects in Public Secondary Schools in Rachuonyo North Sub County, Kenya (Doctoral dissertation, university of nairobi).
21. OECD., K. (2018). OECD science, technology and innovation Outlook 2018. Paris: OECD Publishing.
22. Sadia, M. (2017). Factors influencing the implementation of income generating projects in public secondary schools in Isiolo North Sub County, Kenya.
23. Salazar, N. S. (2023). Board Competency for Fiduciary Governance Responsibilities: Basis for Competency and Fiduciary Enhancement Programs. In *9TH INTERNATIONAL SCHOLARS'CONFERENCE PROCEEDINGS*.
24. Savuli, E. (2018). Factors Influencing Principals' Effectiveness, In Financial Management in Public Secondary Schools in Mwingi Central Sub-County, Kitui County-Kenya (Doctoral dissertation, University of Nairobi).
25. Sidki, M., Boerger, L., & Boll, D. (2023). The effect of board members' education and experience on the financial performance of German state-owned enterprises. *Journal of Management and Governance*, 1-38.
26. Sutaguna, I. N. T., Yusuf, M., Ardianto, R., & Wartono, P. (2023). The Effect Of Competence, Work Experience, Work Environment, And Work Discipline On Employee Performance. *Asian Journal of Management, Entrepreneurship and Social Science*, 3(01), 367-381.
27. Van Assche, K., Verschraegen, G., Valentinov, V., & Gruezmacher, M. (2019). The social, the ecological, and the adaptive. Von Bertalanffy's general systems theory and the adaptive governance of social-ecological systems. *Systems Research and Behavioral Science*, 36(3), 308-321.