

# Analysis of Education Policy with Reference to Teacher Education using BOS Framework: An Example

Dr. Amina Noor

*National Skill University, Islamabad, Pakistan*

**Abstract:**-This study serves an example for researchers to use the concept of Blue Ocean Strategy (BOS) in the analysis of education policy. To simplify the method, the study delimited and investigated the directives for teacher education and training from the policy documents. To ensure a consistent, the study first identified some factors on adapting six paths of the first principle of BOS along with three set rules for interpretation. The second analyzed sample policy documents after testing on previous education policy. The analysis reveals that many policy directives were in line with BOS, e.g., inter-provincial collaboration across the training institutions, assessment of teachers' needs, standards, quality of material, incentives, specialized and diverse practice-based training. The planning of these training should be on relevance, curriculum based and a continued process. The participation of stakeholders, community, donors and public-private partnership is also recommended to maintain the quality and resources for training.

**Key Words:** teacher education policy, professional development, teacher training institutes, Blue Ocean Strategy

## I. INTRODUCTION

Policy analysis is a social and political activity. Educationists and scholars take moral and intellectual responsibility for the quality of their policy-analytic work (Bardach, 2012). In researches, the policy analysis is an eclectic process which requires a systematic evidence-based effort to ensure the consistency in various aspects. It emerges from the understanding of the policy making process and then helping them to point out the main decisions about pressing areas, like education, economics, social problems, etc. Historically, this process was first seen in America and then growing in other European countries. Likewise, many countries have made an important contribution to the development of the field by using the techniques of policy analysis and discourse. Fischer, Miller and Sidney (2007) in the study said that it is an advice giving process that requires proper technical information to deal with the complexity of various problems.

In the context of education policy, many countries are concerned about the quality and relevance of education, while some emphasized on the notion of equity by setting educational outcomes and target areas (Ali, 2011; Khan, 2015). Eventually disseminate the policy directives into

sectoral plans to explicit the development strategies. To account these, they recommend guidelines for a basic education, curriculum, teacher education and monitoring system along with an action framework to improve the system. By which various slogans were seen in the past few decades, such as, Education for All, Right to Education, Millennium Development Goals, Sustainability Development Goals, etc. (Khan, 2015) to fill the gap and achieve the required targets.

To bring educational reforms in Pakistan, the basic aim and objectives of various education policies and plans were to address quality, equity and accessibility through the same said slogans. By this, teacher professional development was emphasized in policies as a catalyst that brings rapid change in quantity as well as quality of education. Since dependence 1947, the teacher education was the crucial subject of each National Education Policy and discussed teacher who specifically is responsible for publicizing and coordinating education in each region and inculcate good practices. These policies also advocated the removal of urban-rural and gender imbalances in schools, aiming to improve the quality of education at all levels, particularly through curriculum reform, teacher training, strengthening education facilities, encouraging private sector participation and effective community involvement (Malik, et al. 2014) and the teacher can combat these challenges. To continue these efforts, the National Education Policy 2009 offered the far-reaching education policy initiatives in the country. The hallmark features of the policy compelled provinces to develop "Education Sector Plan" and "Annual Action Plans". After 18<sup>th</sup> constitutional amendment 2010, the educational responsibilities are shifted to the provinces for better services to all citizens in term of access, quality and equity as well as bring changes in their socioeconomic set up (Government of Pakistan, 2009). In this context, the policy recommended good governance and action plan for implementation to conduct public affairs and manage public resources effectively.

The Policy 2009 recognized the responsibility of the Federal government that works as a coordinator and facilitator among provinces and districts. The purpose of the policy was to give uniform strategy in achieving the educational goals which were implemented nationally. In this respect, the policy

emphasized on collaborating mechanism to generate national integrity and appreciated the role of Inter-Provincial Education Minister Conference (IPEMC) to mobilize political, administrative and financial support for the promotion of education.

#### *Teacher training institutes*

Bezzina, Lorist, and Velzen said that the partnership between schools and teacher education institutes nowadays are about the possibilities for student-teachers to really participate in school practice and at the same time to acquire the knowledge, skills and values necessary to become qualified teachers (Bezzina, Lorist, & Velzen, 2006). This collaborative approach links theory into workable practices and promotes the concept of school based teacher education. Furthermore, it professionalizes teacher in goal setting, problem solving, decision making, student assessment, and monitoring and curriculum development assist in the solution of the individual teaching problem.

Pakistan has same practices for teacher development in collaboration with schools. The teacher training institutes in each province and federal area have a mandate to impart both pre-service and in-service teacher training programs in all disciplines based on national curricula. These have a mechanism for disseminating training to regions and districts of the provinces through associated training centres and schools, while some are working in collaboration with other organizations like; Pakistan Science Foundation, Pakistan Science Museum, Educational Boards of Intermediate, Higher Education Commission, etc. They also organized various programs especially for teacher educators and managers, according to the directions of National Education Policy (2009) and Provincial Education Plans (Noor, 2018).

The researches make this point clear that the teacher training for primary, secondary and high secondary teachers improve teacher quality and competency professionally. These programs would also enable them to enhance the teacher's work motivation and job-satisfaction which in turn would improve their job-performance (Ali, 2011; Bezzina, Lorist & Velzen 2006; Hutabarat, 2015). In addition to that, the performance level of trained teachers also shows the effectiveness of training institutes who intend to achieve the set outcomes which directly concern with the transformation of learnt contents and practices (Noor, 2018).

#### *Professional development*

The investment in teacher education is essential to practice content and pedagogical skill to deal with difficulties in adapting to change or pressure at school (Dancy & Henderson, 2007). It is their need not only for their professional development, but also in the exploration of new learning opportunities for growth and recognition (Villegas-Reimers, 2003; Martina, Summers, & Sjerps-Jones, 2007). But in reality, the trainings are not providing adequate teaching standards worldwide and training institutes are not

perceived high quality programs (Malik & Behlol, 2014). In fact, teacher development is beyond the content knowledge, skills and techniques and it might also be considered the functional, emotional and future needs of the teacher trainee. The BOS upends traditional thinking and creates different value proportions by reconstructing new boundaries and focusing beyond the existing state (Kim & Mauborgne, 2005). Therefore, this study analyzed the education policy using the theoretical lens of BOS to know the intervention of teacher education as well as recommended to use BOS in the management phase of training to address the actual need of a teacher.

#### *Significance of Blue Ocean Strategy: A theoretical framework*

The concept of the Blue Ocean Strategy (BOS) was first introduced by INSEAD Professors W. Chin Kim and Renee Mauborgne (2005) widely cited Harvard Business Reviews and research articles. This study shows the strength of BOS paths which give an opportunity to see the holistic view of any creation, rethink the challenges and identifies the new or untapped dimensions.

There are limited examples that show the use of BOS in education and even no example related to policy analysis. But, the researchers of various studies claim that BOS can be employed in every new creation, because it analyzes current situation and use analytical tools and frameworks for maintaining accuracy. Such as, Hollensen (2013) said that it is a dynamic process that refines the practices to open up new and uncontested space for progression. Savage and Brommels (2008) suggest that employing the blue ocean strategy framework assists in understanding the dynamics of innovation and success in the field of medical education. They designed SPICES (Student – Centered, problem – based Integrated, community – based, Elective – dominant, Systematic) model that graphically illustrates the difference between traditional and innovative medical Schools. Straub (2009) explores “Intellectual Blue” by identifying the scholarly publications in top journals. He describes how the Blue Ocean Strategy can be used in accepting innovative papers. The strategic process of Blue Ocean is specifically instituted to address the need of stakeholders in developing a new program or designing a curriculum (Jones, 2010; Mills & Kelly, 2012).

Due to high impact, and rapid implemented strategies framework, the Eleventh Malaysian Plan 2016-2020 adapted BOS to anchor growth of people and transform policy directives to shift the paradigm of sustainability (Government of Malaysia, 2016).

In this respect, the study depicted the strength of policy document by using theoretical lens of Blue Ocean Strategy (BOS) and analysed directives of teacher education and training. In addition, it provides an opportunity to the managers of training institutes to plan a program for teachers by introducing significant changes in the way that teacher trainees are trained.

*Objectives:*

The present study provides to answer the following two research objectives:

- To what extent the government policy and provincial plans give the provision of teacher development, managing training and support in consonance with the Blue Ocean Strategy, and
- To what extent, the policy documents reflect the Blue Ocean Strategy to move away from the traditional notion of teacher training management and broaden the concept of professional development.

## II. METHODOLOGY

It is a descriptive study attempted to analyze policy and plans to examine the provisions for teacher education and training in the context of the six paths of the first principle of Blue Ocean Strategy. In order to collect evidence from the sample policy documents, the factors were selected on each criterion (Table. 1) from the literature review to elaborate the BOS concept and to maintain the descriptive validity of the documents. Then discussed with experts and the supervisor and piloted on the National Education Policy 1998- 2010. At initial stage some discrepancies and ambiguities were identified in interpretation of the key factors and method of analysis. To make the process of analysis more consistent and reliable, the following rules were set for interpretation.

1. The education documents would be analyzed only on the basis of key selected factors.
2. If all documents focus on the same factors and give the same strategic actions, the analysis would be summarized.
3. If all documents focus the same factors, but their strategies or actions were different, then each action would be explained separately.

After obtaining a consensus on the interpretation of each key factor, the researcher and the expert independently analyzed the National Education Policy 1998- 2010, to verify the selected factors of each criterion aspect. After analysed the piloted policy, the researcher analyzed the following policy documents:

1. National Education Policy (NEP) 2009
2. The Education Sector Plan (2010- 2015) of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK),
3. The Punjab School Education Sector Plan (2013-2017),
4. The Balochistan Education Sector Plan (2013-2017), and
5. The Sindh Education Sector Plan (2013-2016).

All provincial plans (2 to 5) follow the directives of NEP 2009 and are interconnected with each other. All documents prioritized the importance of the teacher education and training to impart quality in education.

## III. FINDINGS

The study presented the BOS criterion-wise description and highlighted the government interventions for teacher education and training.

*Criterion 1: looking across the alternative organizations for improving training*

In order to collect evidence from the National Education Policy 2009 and Provincial plans regarding teacher education and training, the three factors were considered in the analysis process to cover the criterion 1 of BOS; Involvement of stakeholders, Public-private partnership and Involvement of community.

The government documents envisaged the importance of collaborating approach among stakeholders in the development of education sectoral reforms. In this respect, the formation of national policy was a combined effort of stakeholders belonging to various organizations including; Higher Education Commission, National Vocational and Technical Education Commission, Institute for Educational Development- Aga Khan University, Academy of Educational Planning and Management, Pakistan Medical and Dental Council and Pakistan Engineering Council. Moreover, the government was more concerned about the quality of education which is related to curriculum, teacher and teaching methodology and suggested to take technical consultation from these organizations for the development of relevant curriculum (Government of Pakistan, 2009). The same practice was mentioned in Punjab School Education Sector Plan (2013- 2017) to promote good governance in educational institutions. The Education Sector Plan of Balochistan mapped stakeholders into two categories; power - who deals the educational matters politically and interest- who deals to improve quality of education system (Government of Balochistan, 2013). The purpose of this mapping is to disseminate the educational interventions down to grassroots level. These provisions in policy documents reflected the reformatting approach of stakeholders which supports the Blue Ocean Strategy.

To sustain the actions of Education Sector Reforms or/ and bring them in continuation, the National Education Policy 2009 emphasized the public- private partnership (PPP) and public- public partnership in the following areas;

- Setting standards for education
- Globalization and competitiveness in education
- Social exclusion and social cohesion
- Leveraging international educational development partnerships

These areas encouraged the blended system, which is BOS based approach to promote the uniformity in the system and created various synergistic linkages between the Technical, Vocational, Professional and scientific education

reported by Economic Survey of Pakistan for financial benefits (Government of Pakistan 2014).

Besides PPP, the impact of School Management Committees (SMCs) is verified by various researches to bring refinement and accuracy in the system. Teachers are playing a key role in strengthening relationships between the schools and local communities. SMC members believe in working in collaboration and fulfill their roles as the key representatives of the community. They showed commitment, consensus and mutual respect bring change in education (Khan, 2006; Rose, 2018). The policy also recommended the involvement of community by developing SMCs or Parent Teachers Associations. In the light of policy directives, Balochistan has taken action to strengthen the role of STEPS (Student, teachers, educationists, parents and society) for school development, student enrollment and generating funds (Government of Balochistan, 2013). Similarly, the government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has developed Parent Teacher Councils (PTCs) in more than twenty seven thousand schools for the promotion of the education in the sector (Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, 2012).

It is a fact that the change in the system needs years for acceptance. The stakeholders, PPP and community reformers help the system for quality assurance. Some of the researchers endorsed that the true development comes from the involvement of vicinity for seeking technical and financial advice (Khan, 2006; Malik, et al., 2014; Rose, 2018).

*Criterion 2: looking across the training institutions for teacher development*

The five factors were considered to cover this aspect of BOS; Intra and Inter- provincial collaboration for managing training, quality of teacher trainers, training budget and monitoring and evaluation.

The education policy 2009 said that the in-service teacher training institutions shall emphasize on developing the capacity of teachers and school managers for school development plans to overcome low achievement scores (p. 44). By this direction, all provincial plans mentioned some strategies for teacher development through the training of Initial Teacher Education (ITE), Continuous Professional Development (CPD) or in-service teacher education and the overall management of teacher quality. They acknowledged the worth of various training institutions like Provincial Institute for Training and Education (PITEs), Bureaus, Textbook and Examination Boards, the Policy Planning and Implementation Unit (PPIU), Directorate of Schools, Directorate of Staff development, etc., to develop formal Intra and Inter coordination mechanisms and ensure transparent selection of teachers, relevance in teaching, student assessment and conduct impact study to review the quality of training management.

The previous and current policy documents endorsed the contribution and collaboration mechanism through Inter-

Provincial Education Ministers' Conference (IPEMC) as well as international donor agencies such as; Ed-link, GIZ, USAID Pre-Step (pre-service teacher education program), Canadian International Development Authority (CIDA), Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA), etc., but did not give any provision of training to develop private school teachers and managers, although the policy suggested drawing upon resources from the private sector through PPP, especially in the areas of teacher education (Government of Pakistan, 2009).

In NEP 2009 also provided the detailed implementation plan to bring provinces and districts on board in the process of monitoring and evaluation and recommended to design the action plan along with defined time schedule. This strategy is helpful to prevent failure of the policy and suggested to develop an implementation framework, with a follow up and feedback mechanism, like BOS canvas.

In addition to that the policy recommended taking ownership and active participation of all stakeholders and tiers for smooth functioning in terms of modalities and time schedules. In this context, the policy highlighted the quality of teacher trainers or educators and recommended a separate cadre of teacher trainers and specialized training for them. Further, it enforced teacher training institutes to standardize and institutionalize the teacher training arrangements, accreditation and certification procedures (Government of Pakistan, 2009).

*Criterion 3: looking across the chain of target group (trainees)*

This aspect of BOS was applied to see to what extent the NEP 2009 and the Provincial Education Plans addressed the needs of teacher trainee and performance standards and said:

Provision of quality education requires a mechanism for internal and external evaluation of quality parameters. In this regards it is necessary to ensure that program and university accreditation mechanisms are instituted that are compatible with international best practices and provide complete transparency of operation leading to the enhanced provision of quality education (NEP, 2009, p.55).

These policy directives were framed to provide quality teacher in a system as:

- The selection criteria should be uniformed by Public Service Commission.
- The six months pre-service training or diploma in teaching methodologies, communication skills, research and assessment techniques should be undertaken for teaching.
- A continuous professional development (CPD) program shall be designed for school, college and

university teachers along with the mechanism of a three-year-cyclic in-service teacher training.

- The policy of pre-service teacher education should be revised and set eligibility criteria for teaching, i.e., a Bachelors degree with B.ED for elementary level and Masters for teaching at Secondary and higher secondary level.

Furthermore, the documents suggested both pre-service and in-service teacher education and training should be designed according to the national curriculum. They also devoted to improving quality and learning opportunities of these teachers, the standardized and institutionalized the training mechanism, accreditation process and certification procedures should be introduced. In this context, the policy directed the provincial administrations to develop effective accountability mechanisms and use Education Management Information System to record data of teacher deployment, attendance, noncompliance activities and multiple job-holding services etc, (Government of Pakistan, 2009) to assess their performance.

The plans encompassed policy directives and gave the performance indicators, assessment framework and benchmarks for teacher's evaluation related to punctuality, dress, morality, command-over teaching and motivation. In addition, they recommended to conduct the teacher support programs aligned with school curriculum and Curriculum Implementation Framework through need based analysis. Whereas, the plan of Balochistan directed CPD management committee to oversee the implementation process of the training program and review the training capacity of the provincial training institutions (Government of Balochistan, 2013).

Many reports advocate gender and area equality (AED & USAID, 2007; OECD, 2012; UNESCO & ITA, 2013; ASER Pakistan Secretariat & ITA, 2013). In this context, the policy documents devoted the need of girls and adult female education which requires female teachers, especially in the rural and undeveloped areas. They emphasized on both formal and non-formal training program to launch flexible bridging courses and CPD for female teachers to upgrade their qualifications and skills to cater the need of these learners. They also announced incentives for subject-specialist teachers working in rural areas.

Teachers are considered the lynchpin for quality and implementation of education reforms in the classrooms, where the actual learning takes place. The satisfaction of the teacher (main client) from teacher education and training would enhance their retention.

*Criterion 4: looking across the complementary training product and service*

This aspect of BOS was applied in document analysis to see to what extent the NEP 2009 and Provincial Education Plans addressed the training-teaching product

(Training curriculum) and service (Methods and Techniques) according to the needs of teacher trainees.

The researchers advocate the capacity building of teachers through training content which develop conceptual understanding, pedagogical skill, procedural knowledge, problem solving, reasoning and feedback skill as well as administration to supervise the educational affairs (Alsubaie, 2016; Bukhari & Malik, 2013; Chalmers, 2008; Noor, Rifat, & Huma, 2016). The content of the training program (pre and in-service) should be related to school curriculum. In this respect, the policy 2009 recommended the objective driven and outcome based curriculum and teaching material which focuses on learning outcomes rather than content and closely reflect important social issues. The teaching methodology would give privilege to self-directed learning, the spirit of inquiry, critical thinking, problem-solving and team-work. For this teacher should provide pedagogical content knowledge, testing and assessment practice skills, multi-grade teaching, monitoring and evaluation skills along with a command of the English language and Information Communication Technology (Government of Pakistan, 2009).

In this context, the plans highlighted the student-centered teaching methodology and techniques to develop cross-curricular competencies in teachers so that education should lead to the development of the whole child—intellectually, personally, and socially which address the learning difficulties and local problems in the environment to enrich the subject matter and make it more relevant to the need of provincial teachers.

The effective training curriculum, interactive training methodology and techniques are the complementary product and services for teacher development and training management (Ischinger, 2009). The documents considered these factors in detail to connect the teacher teaching in the perspective of their students.

*Criterion 5: looking across the functional and emotional appeal (attraction) from training*

This aspect of BOS was applied in the process of document analysis to see to what extent the policy documents addressed the specialized training, incentives (compensation) and rights of teachers.

Generally, the training programs intend to provide cognitive, personal and social competency and communication competency in order to integrate learning objectives with associated learning situations for better transformation of knowledge. But, in particular conditions the teacher also required some special training for individual consultation of the student. The NEP 2009 also enforced these social competencies of teachers and presented as:

Counselling facilities shall be made available to students from the elementary level onwards in order to constructively utilize their energy, to deal with any

displays of aggression amongst young students and to address any other psychological distress that a student may be in, by suggesting a suitable remedy (p. 37).

The studies of Ischinger (2009), Khan (2006) and Whitehead (2009) presented the multiple role of teacher to draw attention on social and cultural responsibilities of students for community development. The success of the students increases their self esteem and equipped them to deal with the challenges of life. The same suggested by the education policy to provide career guidance and counselling facility in each school or arrange at least in one of the cluster schools to improve the learning environment.

Furthermore, the policy 2009 recommended the advanced training program on emergencies which could be required for student safety. In this context, it suggested to design training curricula to enable the teacher to address emergencies (natural and man-made). As well as a repository of all emergency related materials, manuals, guidelines, minimum standards and research facilities in all educational institutions.

Along with these capabilities, the teacher needs respectable social status and attractive incentives. This aspect is also effectively included in the policy 2009 in the form of incentives, CPD, and a reward system based on performance. All over, the policy supported the teacher integrity as “the voice of teacher associations shall be given due consideration in decisions on collective issues affecting teachers”. It is an emotional act of national policy document that support of one person for another. The same issue Alif Ailaan elaborates on the study that the majority of Pakistan’s teachers are dedicated professionals, aware of their own shortcomings and eager to improve their performance. They need to be addressed with required training which takes into account the cultural and linguistic diversity that constitutes the fabric of Pakistani society (Alif Ailaan, 2015).

Teachers always emphasized the benefits of positivity rather than being negative in Education. The student’s blossom, if they are loved, praised and appreciated unconditionally for their unique individuality. Teachers know this on the rational level, but practically they do not behave likewise. Therefore, the policy actions and plan strategies addressed the social cohesion to fight against exclusion and marginalization system in education and create a sense of belonging to promote trust environment in educational institutions.

#### *Criterion 6: looking across time*

In a world of growing diversity and challenge, teachers must do more than help students master the sets of knowledge and skills acquired through the standard subject curriculum. They must prepare students fully for their lives as individuals and as members of society, with the capacity to achieve their goals, contribute to their communities and

continue learning throughout their lives. In this context, BOS suggested looking across time by creating diversity in trainings.

The policy analysis addressed the integrated approach in educational disciplines and diversity in teacher training to deal with the current situation as well as with the future interventions. Further, the policy recommended to the provincial government to develop a suitable National Qualification Framework (NQF) for technical and scientific education and training with close involvement of Chambers of Commerce and Industry (Government of Pakistan, 2009). The main intention of the government is to move the knowledge economy by increasing investment in science and technology field to compete the world’s economy. For this, some reports emphasized to apply modern methodologies and technologies in education and other field to project operational efficiency and better quality delivery (Ministry of Science and Technology, 2012; OECD, 2012).

#### IV. DISCUSSION

This study applied the adapted BOS criteria, based on first principle of the BOS, to analyze the identities of teacher education and training given in the educational policy documents. The analysis revealed that some of the strategies of the documents are the same as given in BOS.

The policy documents addressed both the formal and non formal interventions for professional development of teachers. They acknowledged the significant role of various national and international organizations for updating educational strategies as well as catering productive resources (Government of Pakistan, 2009). This guided strategy to look across the alternative organizations reflected BO. To revitalization of educational strategies and standards, the NEP 2009 provided an implementation framework along with a follow up and feedback mechanism. It also strengthened the role of the Inter Provincial Education Ministers’ Conference (IPEM) - the highest inter-provincial coordination body to supervise the development mechanism and increase the accessibility and accountability (Khan, 2015). This IPEM reform related to BOS to harmonize efforts by inter and intra provincial coordination.

It is documented in researches that the teacher education plays an instrumental role in the quality of education which related to teaching standards. These standards monitor the knowledge, skill and dispositions as well as competency level of a teacher (Ali, 2011; AITSL, 2015, Ministry of Education 2009; Noor 2018).

The other policy directives were to strengthen the roles of teacher training institutes and develop a 5-year plan for the implementation. Carry out a capacity audit exercise to identify the areas for improvement and resources for teacher development (Government of Balochistan, 2013). While, for quality assurance, the competency- based training program

would introduce for teachers and educators. In fact, the quality is related to value creation (Kim & Mauborgne, 2005) to reach their maximum potential. Similarly, policy documents recommended that the training would be relevant, continued and objective- driven to value the performance of the trainee-teacher. Besides, the policy said that a regular appraisal system would introduce to assess the performance of teachers and teacher educators.

In the context of qualitative development, the policy emphasized on the importance of pedagogy skills of student centered approach that improvised the teaching resources that encourage group work and activity based learning. Teachers are often motivated by a sense of service, compensation and prestige in the society and perform well in schools (Noor, 2018). While, many other studies pointed out that the appointed teacher turnover rate is high due to a lower level of self-efficacy (Hassan, 2008; Alif Ailaan, 2015; Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development, 2012). To envisage this problem, NEP 2009 addressed hard/rural area allowance, bridging courses and promotion of teachers. Moreover, the training would resolve the personal, social and environmental issues by designing the specialized programs. This taps the untapped areas that reflect the BOS approach and training managers would envisage better services and project training experiences.

A plethora of recommendations exists to focus on the teacher development and give provision to Blue Ocean Strategy to consider all aspects before designing the training program by setting utmost priorities to reduce the system gap in existing practices.

## V. CONCLUSION

This study provides a suitable idea to policy makers and the management of teacher training organizations to help mark down clear objectives of what they want to achieve and how best to meet the needs of trainees and shareholders. The important aspect of this study is how it utilizes Blue Ocean strategies in the planning and implementation stage, putting teachers' needs at the forefront. The integration of BOS might help to generate resources, improve capabilities and competencies, and help with a sustainable plan for teachers. BOS is already reflected in policy directives, though unintentionally, and keeping in mind how effective it has been, it can be suggested that if a conscious effort was made to adopt BOS, it would flourish tremendously, and without causing too much change to the existing directives.

## VI. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE STUDY

Since, the scope of the research was limited to Pakistan and only addressed the component of teacher education, so it is recommended that the further studies can be designed on other components of policy documents. BOS paths can be adapted to formulate and/ or analyse teacher –

student development program, material development program, impact studies etc.

## REFERENCES

- [1]. Academy for Educational Development [AED] & USAID. (2006). *Performance Gap analysis and Training Needs Assessment of Teacher Training Institutions in Pakistan*. Islamabad: USAID & Ministry of Education.
- [2]. Academy for Educational Development [AED] & USAID. (2007). *Pakistan Teacher Education And Professional Development Program*. Islamabad: [http://pdf.usaid.gov/pdf\\_docs/Pnadi362.pdf](http://pdf.usaid.gov/pdf_docs/Pnadi362.pdf).
- [3]. Ahmed, J., Kothari, & Gul. (2016). A Researched case study on Blue Ocean Strategy Implementation . *Asian Management Research and Case Conference, Dubai*, <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/319979187>.
- [4]. Ali, S. (2013). Pakistan: Target revision in education policy . In M.-e.-R. Ahmed (Ed.), *Education in West Central Asia*, pp. 163-177 . London: Bloomsbury. [http://ecommons.aku.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1231&context=book\\_chapters](http://ecommons.aku.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1231&context=book_chapters).
- [5]. Ali, T. (2011). Understanding how practices of teacher education in Pakistan compare with the popular theories and theories and narrative of reform of teacher education in international context. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 1 (8). Retrieved on July 7, 2015 from [https://ecommons.aku.edu/pakistan\\_ied\\_pdck/84/](https://ecommons.aku.edu/pakistan_ied_pdck/84/).
- [6]. Alif Ailaan. (2015). *The Voice Of Teachers*. Retrieved from [http://www.alifailaan.pk/voice\\_of\\_teachers](http://www.alifailaan.pk/voice_of_teachers)
- [7]. Alsubaie, M. A. (2016). Curriculum Development: Teacher Involvement in Curriculum Development . *Journal of Education and Practice Journal of Education and Practice* , 7 (9), pp. 106-107, ISSN 2222-288X (Online). <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1095725.pdf>.
- [8]. ASER Pakistan Secretariat & ITA. (2013). *Annual Status of Education Report*. Retrieved from [http://www.aserpakistan.org/document/aser/2013/reports/national/ASER\\_National\\_Report\\_2013.pdf](http://www.aserpakistan.org/document/aser/2013/reports/national/ASER_National_Report_2013.pdf)
- [9]. Australian Institute for Teaching and School Leadership [AITSL]. (2015). *Annual Report (2014-2015)*. Australian Institute for Teaching and School Leadership. <http://www.aitsl.edu.au/docs/default-source/annual-reports-resources/2015/aitsl-annual-report-2015-overview.pdf?sfvrsn=2> Retrieved on December 20, 2015.
- [10]. Bardach, E. (2012). *A Practical Guide for Policy Analysis. 4th Edition*. London: SAGE Publications Ltd. EC1Y ISP, United Kingdom.
- [11]. Bezzina, C., Lorist, P., & Velzen, C. v. (2006). Partnerships between Schools and Teacher Education Institutes. (pp. 747- 758). : National School for Leadership in Education, University of Ljubljana, Faculty of Education <http://www.pef.uni-lj.si/atee/978-961-6637-06-0/747-758.pdf>.
- [12]. Bhatti, M., Bano, S., Khanam, F., & Hussain, A. ( 2010 ). *Problems in the Implementation of National Education Policies at Elementary level*. Islamabad: Academy of Educational Planning and Management, Ministry of Education.
- [13]. Bukhari, S. N., & Malik, S. K. (2013). Effectiveness of Teachers Transformational Leadership Style on Students' Academic Achievement . *Pakistan Journal of Education*, 1-18.
- [14]. Chalmers, D. (2008). Teaching and Learning Quality Indicators in Australian Universities. *The OECD's Higher Education Management and Policy Journal*, <http://www.oecd.org/site/eduimhe08/41216416.pdf>.
- [15]. Dancy, M., & Henderson, C. (2007). A Framework for articulating instructional practices and conceptions. *Physical Review Special Topics: Physics Education Research*, 3(1), DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevSTPER.3.010103, 1-15.

- [16]. Field, H. (1979). Competency Based Teacher Education (CBTE): A Review of the Literature. *Journal of In-Service Education*, 6 (1), 39-42, DOI: 10.1080/0305763790060109.
- [17]. Fischer, F., Miller, G. J., & Sidney, M. S. (2007). *Handbook of Public Policy Analysis: Theory, Politics, and Methods*. New York: CRC Press, Taylor & Francis Group.
- [18]. Government of Balochistan. (2013). *Balochistan Education Sector Plan -2013-2017*. Quetta: Policy Planning and Implementation Unit, Department of Education .
- [19]. Government of Balochistan. (2013). *Balochistan Teacher Education Strategy 2013-2018*. Quetta: Government of Balochistan & USAID.
- [20]. Government of KhyberPakhtunkhwa. (2012). *Education Sector Plan 2010-2015*. <http://www.kpese.gov.pk/Downloads/Education%20Sector%20Plan.pdf>: Elementary and Secondary Education Department.
- [21]. Government of Malaysia. (2016). *The Eleventh Malaysia Plan, 2016-2020*. Retrieved from Economic Planning Unit: <http://epu.gov.my/en/rmk/eleventh-malaysia-plan-2016-2020>
- [22]. Government of Pakistan. (1998). *National Education Policy 1998-2010*. Islamabad: Ministry of Education.
- [23]. Government of Pakistan. (2009). *National Education Policy* . Islamabad: Ministry of Education.
- [24]. Government of Pakistan. (2014). *Economic Survey of Pakistan 2013-2014*. Islamabad: Ministry of Finance .
- [25]. Government of Sindh. (2013). *Sindh Education Sector Plan 2013-2016*. Education and Literacy Department, Sindh.
- [26]. Hassan, U. M. (2008). *An Analytical Study of Human Resource Development Through Inservice Teachers Training and Development. (PhD thesis)*. Islamabad: National University of Modern Languages. <http://pr.hec.gov.pk/Thesis/670S.pdf>.
- [27]. Hollensen, S. (2013). The Blue Ocean that Disappeared â€“The Case of Nintendo Wii” . *Journal of Business Strategy*, 34 (2), pp 25-35. <http://centres.insead.edu/blue-ocean-strategy/strategy-articles/academic.cfm>.
- [28]. Hutabarat, W. (2015). Investigation of Teacher Job-Performance Model: Organizational Culture, Work Motivation and Job-Satisfaction. *Asian Social Science, Published by Canadian Center of Science and Education*. 11(18), ISSN 1911-2017 E-ISSN 1911-2025, doi:10.5539/ass.v11n18p295.
- [29]. Ischinger, B. (2009). *Creating Effective Teaching and Learning Environments. OECD's Teaching and Learning International Survey*. Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development.
- [30]. İŞMAN, A. (2011). Instructional Design in Education: New Model. *The Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology (TOJET)*, 10 (1), pp. 136-142. <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ926562.pdf>.
- [31]. Jones, D. L. (2010). Developing a Convention and Event Management Curriculum in Asia: Using Blue Ocean Strategy and Co-Creation with Industry. *Journal of Convention & Event Tourism*, 11 ( 2): 154-158. <http://centres.insead.edu/blue-ocean-strategy/stra>.
- [32]. Khan, A. S. (2015). *Assessment of the Performance of the Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training June2013toJune2014*. Islamabad: Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development And Transparency - PILDAT.
- [33]. Khan, S. (2006). Role of school management committee in strengthening relationships between the school and local community in a community based school in Pakistan. Dissertation. Aga Khan University, Karachi, Pakistan. [http://ecommons.aku.edu/theses\\_dissertations/174/](http://ecommons.aku.edu/theses_dissertations/174/).
- [34]. Kim, C., & Mauborgne, R. (2005). *Blue Ocean Strategy*. Harvard Business Review Press.
- [35]. Malik, A. A., & Behlol, M. (2014). Identification of the factors of quality teacher training and development of a Model program in Pakistan . *VFAST Transactions on Education and Social Sciences*, 5 (2). 1-15.
- [36]. Malik, A. B., Amin, N., Ahmad, K., Mukhtar, E. M., Saleem, M., & Kakli, M. B. (2014). *Pakistan Education for All Review Report 2015*. Islamabad: Ministry of Education, Trainings and Standards in Higher Education & Academy of Educational Planning and Management.
- [37]. Martina, K., Summers, D., & Sjerps-Jones, H. (2007). Sustainability and teacher education. *Journal of Further and Higher Education*, Vol. 31(4), pp. 351-362.
- [38]. Mills, R. J., & Kelly, F. (2012). E-Learning as a Career Path in Information Systems Curricula: A Blue Ocean Opportunity. *American Journal of Business Education*, 5 (2): 103-114. <http://centres.insead.edu/blue-ocean-strategy/strategy-articles/aca>.
- [39]. Ministry of Education. (2009). *National Professional Standards for Teachers in Pakistan*. <http://unesco.org.pk/education/teachereducation/files/NationalProfessionalStandardsforTeachers.pdf>.
- [40]. Ministry of Science and Technology. (2012). *National Science, Technology and Innovation Policy*. Islamabad: Government of Pakistan.
- [41]. Noor, A. (2018). *Formulation of Key Performance Indicators on the Basis of Blue Ocean Strategy for Managing In-Service Teacher Training Institutions in Pakistan*. Thesis of Doctor of Philosophy, Islamabad: Faculty of Education, Allama Iqbal Open University.
- [42]. Noor, A., Rifat, Q., & Huma, A. (2016). Analysis of Management Support and Teaching Practices for the Implementation of New Elementary Science Curriculum in Islamabad Model Schools. *Science, Technology and Development*, Vol 35 (1) :6-15, ISSN 0254-6418 / DOI: 10.3923/std.2016.6.15.
- [43]. Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development [OECD]. (2012). *OECD Indicators of Education System*. Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development. [www.oecd.org/edu](http://www.oecd.org/edu).
- [44]. Rose, M. (2018, July 19). *Teachers need to build strong relationships with school stakeholders*. Retrieved from Business Mirror: <https://businessmirror.com.ph/byline/rose-macapulay/>
- [45]. Savage, C., & Brommels, M. (2008). *Innovation in Medical Education: How Linkoping Created a Blue Ocean for Medical Education in Sweden*. Retrieved from <https://www.linkedin.com/in/carlsavage>
- [46]. Straub, D. W. (2009). Creating Blue Oceans of Thought via Highly Citable Articles. *MIS Quarterly Journal*, 33(4) : pp. 3-7. <http://centres.insead.edu/blue-ocean-strategy/strategy-articles/academic.cfm>.
- [47]. UNESCO & ITA. (2013). *Status of Teachers in Pakistan*. Lahore: Idara-e- Taleem-o-Aagahi. Retrieved from [http://unesco.org.pk/education/documents/2014/publications/Status\\_of\\_Teachers\\_in\\_Pakistan.pdf](http://unesco.org.pk/education/documents/2014/publications/Status_of_Teachers_in_Pakistan.pdf)
- [48]. Villegas-Reimers, E. (2003). *Teacher professional development: an international review of the literature*. Paris: International Institute for Educational Planning. <http://www.unesco.org/iiep>.
- [49]. Whitehead, J. (2009). Self-study, Living Educational Theories, and the Generation of Educational Knowledge. *Studying Teacher Education*, Vol. 5, No. 2, <http://www.actionresearch.net/writings/jwselfstudyjournal1109.pdf>, 107-111.

#### AUTHOR

Amina Noor has completed her PhD from the department of Educational Planning, Policy Studies and Leadership, Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad. Her research topic was “Formulation of Key Performance Indicators on the Basis of Blue Ocean Strategy for Managing In-Service Teacher Training Institutions in Pakistan”. It was qualitative research and submitted article was a part of the PhD thesis. Currently, she is working as a Senior Research Officer at the National Skill University, previously called National Institute for Science and Technical Education (NISTE), Islamabad which



was the institute for training of science and technical teachers. She involved in the course development program of AIOU and developed two units of Educational Leadership-MA in

Educational Planning and Management and a unit on Planning for Science Teaching- ADE program of science education department of AIOU.

Table 1. *Selected Factors on BOS Criterion*

|    | Criterion on BOS Paths  | Factors   | Literature Review   |
|----|---|---|---|
| 1. | Looking Across the Alternative Organizations for Training                     | Involvement of community and stakeholders and public-private partnership  | Ali, 2011; Alif Ailaan, 2015; UNESCO & ITA, 2013  |
| 2. | Looking Across the Teacher Training Institutions for Teacher Development      | Intra and Inter- provincial collaboration for managing training, Quality of Teacher Trainers, Training Budget, Monitoring and Evaluation. | Bezzina, Lorist, & Velzen, 2006; Ischinger, 2009; Academy for Educational Development & USAID, 2006; Academy for Educational Development & USAID, 2007. |
| 3. | Looking Across the Chain of Target Group (trainees)                           | Teacher needs and performance standards   | Chalmers, 2008; Field, 1979; Ministry of Education, 2009; UNESCO & ITA, 2013; Government of Balochistan, 2013.  |
| 4. | Looking Across the Complementary Training Product and Service                 | Training curriculum, Methods and Techniques   | Alsubaie, 2016; Bukhari & Malik, 2013; İŞMAN, 2011  |
| 5. | Looking Across the Functional and Emotional Appeal (Attraction) from Training | Specialized training, incentives (compensation) and teacher's rights  | Australian Institute for Teaching and School Leadership, 2015; Alif Ailaan, 2015.   |
| 6. | Looking Across Time   | Diversity in training   | Bukhari & Malik, 2013; Dancy & Henderson, 2007; Field, 1979; Martina, Summers, & Sjerps-Jones, 2007.  |